

Informational Markets & Reliability Committee Discussion – CP Penalty Rate
Hyatt Regency Chesapeake Bay Resort, Cambridge, MD
May 1, 2023
3:30 p.m. – 5:00 p.m. EPT

Administration (3:30-3:35)

1. Stu Bresler and David Anders welcomed stakeholders and provided the Anti-trust, Code of Conduct, and Meeting Participation announcements.

Informational Discussion (3:35-5:00)

2. Capacity Performance Penalties (3:35-5:00)
 - A. Marji Philips and Tom Hoatson, LS Power, discussed a proposed Problem Statement, Issue Charge, and solution addressing Capacity Performance (CP) penalty and stop loss calculations, and Performance Assessment Interval (PAI) definition.
 - B. Lynn Horning, American Municipal Power, discussed an alternate solution addressing CP penalty and stop loss calculations, and PAI definition.
 - C. Joe Bowring, IMM, discussed an alternate solution addressing CP penalty and stop loss calculations, and PAI definition.

The committee will be asked to approve the Issue Charge and endorse the proposed solution as part of the Quick Fix process outlined in Section 8.6.1 of Manual 34 at the May 4, 2023 MRC Special Session meeting.

Future Agenda Items (5:00)

No new future agenda items were identified.

Future Meeting Dates and Materials			Materials Due to Secretary	Materials Published
Date	Time	Location		
<i>May 4, 2023</i>	1:00 p.m.	Virtual Only	April 24, 2023	April 27, 2023
<i>May 31, 2023</i>	9:00 a.m.	PJM Conference & Training Center and WebEx	May 19, 2023	May 24, 2023
<i>June 22, 2023</i>	9:00 a.m.	PJM Conference & Training Center and WebEx	June 12, 2023	June 15, 2023
<i>July 26, 2023</i>	9:00 a.m.	PJM Conference & Training Center and WebEx	July 14, 2023	July 19, 2023
<i>August 23, 2023</i>	9:00 a.m.	PJM Conference & Training Center and WebEx	August 11, 2023	August 16, 2023
<i>September 20, 2023</i>	9:00 a.m.	PJM Conference & Training Center and WebEx	September 8, 2023	September 13, 2023

October 25, 2023	9:00 a.m.	PJM Conference & Training Center and WebEx	October 13, 2023	October 18, 2023
November 15, 2023	9:00 a.m.	PJM Conference & Training Center and WebEx	November 3, 2023	November 8, 2023
December 20, 2023	9:00 a.m.	PJM Conference & Training Center and WebEx	December 8, 2023	December 13, 2023

Author: D. Anders

Meeting Attendance

Chair/Secretary

Last Name	First Name	Company	Sector
Bresler	Stu	PJM Interconnection LLC	Not Applicable
Anders	Dave	PJM Interconnection LLC	Not Applicable

Voting Attendees

Last Name	First Name	Company	Sector
Ament	Todd	Cube Hydro Partners, LLC	Generation Owner
Benchek	James	Monongahela Power Company d/b/a Allegheny Power	Transmission Owner
Brodbeck	John	EDP Renewables North America LLC	Generation Owner
Bruce	Susan	Messer LLC	End-Use Customer
Bruce	Susan	Air Products & Chemicals, Inc.	End-Use Customer
Bruce	Susan	Letterkenny Industrial Development Authority - PA	Electric Distributor
Bruce	Susan	Linde Inc.	End-Use Customer
Bruce	Susan	Kimberly-Clark Corporation	Generation Owner
Bruce	Susan	Trustees of the University of Pennsylvania	End-Use Customer
Bruce	Susan	Procter & Gamble Paper Products Company (The)	End-Use Customer
Bruce	Susan	Lehigh Portland Cement Company	End-Use Customer
Bruce	Susan	Gerdau Ameristeel Energy, Inc.	End-Use Customer
Bruce	Susan	Cleveland-Cliffs Steel LLC	End-Use Customer
Bruce	Susan	MeadWestvaco Corporation	End-Use Customer
Canter	David	Appalachian Power Company	Transmission Owner
Davis	James	Virginia Electric & Power Company	Transmission Owner
Domian	Christin	Duquesne Light Company	Transmission Owner
Dugan	Chuck	East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Esquivel	Manuel	Enel X North America, Inc.	Other Supplier
Farnsworth Jr	Byron	Wellsboro Electric Company	Electric Distributor
Fitch	Neal	NRG Power Marketing LLC	Generation Owner
Ford	Adrien	Old Dominion Electric Cooperative	Electric Distributor
Hoatson	Tom	Riverside Generating Company, L.L.C.	Generation Owner
Hohenshilt	Jennifer	Talen Energy Marketing, LLC	Generation Owner
Horning	Lynn	American Municipal Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Horstmann	John	Dayton Power & Light Company (The)	Transmission Owner
Hudis	Gabriella	Jersey Green Energy, LLC	Other Supplier
Hudis	Gabriella	Eagle Point Power Generation LLC	Generation Owner
Hyzinski	Thomas	GenOn Energy Management, LLC	Generation Owner
Hyzinski	Thomas	Carroll County Energy LLC	Generation Owner
Kelly	Stephen	Brookfield Renewable Trading and Marketing LP	Other Supplier
Kilgallen	Kevin	Avangrid Renewables, LLC	Generation Owner
Lee	Aristotle	Grays Ferry Cogeneration Partnership	Generation Owner
Midgley	Sharon	Exelon Business Services Company, LLC	Transmission Owner
Phenix	Michael	Red Oak Power, LLC	Generation Owner
Poulos	Greg	Maryland Office of People's Counsel	End-Use Customer

Poulos	Greg	Delaware Division of the Public Advocate	End-Use Customer
Poulos	Greg	Consumer Protection and Advocate Division of the Tennessee Attorney General	End-Use Customer
Poulos	Greg	New Jersey Division of Rate Counsel	End-Use Customer
Poulos	Greg	Indiana Office of Utility Consumer Counselor (IN OUCC)	End-Use Customer
Poulos	Greg	Public Staff - North Carolina Utilities Commission	End-Use Customer
Rohrbach	John	Wabash Valley Power Association, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Rohrbach	John	Southern Maryland Electric Cooperative, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Rohrbach	John	Kentucky Municipal Energy Agency	Electric Distributor
Scarpignato	David	Calpine Energy Services, L.P.	Generation Owner
Stupar	Rob	Invenergy Energy Management LLC	Generation Owner
Swalwell	Bradley	Tangent Energy Solutions, Inc.	Other Supplier
Sweeney	Rory	Northern Virginia Electric Cooperative (NOVEC)	Electric Distributor
Szeto	Connie	PBF Power Marketing, LLC	End-Use Customer
Tubridy	Meg	Rockland Electric Company	Transmission Owner
Ushijima	Hiroaki	Elwood Energy, LLC	Generation Owner
Walcavich	Colin	Green River Holdings, LLC	Generation Owner
Weeks	Tom	Michigan Public Power Agency	Electric Distributor
Wynder	Michael	Altrock LLC	Other Supplier
Yovanovich	Laura	PPL Electric Utilities Corporation d/b/a PPL Utilities	Transmission Owner

Non-Voting Attendees

Last Name	First Name	Company	Sector
Anderson	Juliet	Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	Generation Owner
Anyanwu	Tito	Geenex Solar LLC	Other Supplier
Ayers	Chris	Public Staff - North Carolina Utilities Commission	End-Use Customer
Bagot	Nancy	EPSA	None
Barker	Jason	Vitol Inc	Generation Owner
Bainbridge	Tom	American Transmission Systems, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Battersby	Robin	Shell Energy North America (US), L.P.	Other Supplier
Berg	Bill	Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	Generation Owner
Bleiweis	Bruce	DC Energy, LLC	Other Supplier
Borgatti	Michael	Gabel & Associates	None
Bowring	Joe	Monitoring Analytics	None
Burkholder	Joshua	AEP Appalachian Transmission Company, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Callen	Zachary	Illinois Commerce Commission	None
Campbell	Bruce	Enerwise Global Technologies, LLC	Other Supplier
Carmean	Gregory	Organization of PJM States, Inc.	None
Carrier	Ron	Big Lake Consulting	None
Catenacci	Glenn	Public Service Electric and Gas Company	Transmission Owner
Chang	Sean	Shell Energy North America (US), L.P.	Other Supplier
Christopher	Mahila	Public Utilities Commission of Ohio	None
Clifford	Brigid	Pine Gate Mid-Atlantic, LLC	Generation Owner
Cocco	Michael	Old Dominion Electric Cooperative	Electric Distributor
Concina	Wendell	Commonwealth Edison Company	Transmission Owner
Corash	Rich	Public Service Electric and Gas Company	Transmission Owner
Cox	Jason	Spotlight Power LLC	Other Supplier
Davis	David	Apex Clean Energy Management, LLC	None
DiNicola	Laura	American Transmission Systems, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Domian	Christin	Duquesne Light Company	Transmission Owner
Dorko	Keri	Monitoring Analytics	None
Dorner	Amber	Rockland Electric Company	Transmission Owner
Douglass	Robert	Constellation Energy Generation, LLC	Generation Owner
Drom	Rick	Non-Member	None
Duensing	Allison	Saracen Power LP	Other Supplier
Edgar-Smith	Collin	Ohio Edison Company	Electric Distributor

Ericson	Christine	Illinois Commerce Commission	None
Evergam	Scott	Blue Horseshoe Energy LLC	None
Fall	Maguette	EDF Renewable Development, Inc.	None
Filomena	Guy	Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.	None
Fink	Sari	American Wind Energy Association	None
Fishback	Luke	Affirmed Energy LLC	Other Supplier
Foladare	Kenneth	Geenex Solar LLC	Other Supplier
Foster Cronin	Denise	East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Fuess	Christian	PBF Power Marketing, LLC	End-Use Customer
Fultz	McClain	PPL Electric Utilities Corporation d/b/a PPL Utilities	Transmission Owner
Garnett	Bryan	Duke Energy Business Services LLC	Transmission Owner
Gilani	Rehan	RWE Clean Energy Wholesale Services, INC.	Other Supplier
Gordon	Jonathan	Advanced Energy United	None
Gorman	Brad	American Transmission Systems, Inc.	Transmission Owner
Gorman	Dan	PALMco Power NJ, LLC dba Indra Energy	Other Supplier
Guerry	Katie	Convergent Energy and Power LP	Other Supplier
Guntle	Vince	American PowerNet Management, L.P.	End-Use Customer
Heinle	Erik	Dynegy Marketing and Trade, LLC	Generation Owner
Heisey	Bradley	Tenaska Pennsylvania Partners, LLC	Generation Owner
Hepplewhite	Peter	Wrigley Capital LLC	Other Supplier
Horning	Lynn	American Municipal Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Hull	Gerit	American Municipal Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor
Hyatt	Earl	Monitoring Analytics	None
Iler	Arthur	Indiana Office of Utility Consumer Counselor (IN OUCC)	End-Use Customer
Janapareddy	Anu	Green River Holdings, LLC	Generation Owner
Janicki	Diane	Boston Energy Trading and Marketing LLC	Other Supplier
Jardot	Gina	NRG Power Marketing LLC	Generation Owner
Johnson	Carl	Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.	None
Johnston	David	Indiana Utility Regulatory Commission	None
Kalaskar	Rahul	AES Laurel Mountain, LLC	Generation Owner
Kauffman	Brian	Enel X North America, Inc.	Other Supplier
Kaczmarkiewicz	John	Vista Energy Marketing, L.P.	Other Supplier
Kent	Janessa	Duquesne Light Company	Transmission Owner
Kerecman	Joe	Calpine Energy Services, L.P	Generation Owner
Kirk	Steven	NextEra Energy Marketing, LLC	Other Supplier
Kogut	George	New York Power Authority	Other Supplier
Kuchan	Meagan	Dayton Power & Light Company (The)	Transmission Owner
Laios	Takis	Appalachian Power Company (AEP Transmission)	Transmission Owner
Leith-Yessian	Devin	RTO Insider	None
Limbaugh	Mary	Kinder Morgan	None
Litchfield	Matt	CPV Power Holdings, LP	Generation Owner
Longo	Kurt	Federal Energy Regulatory Commission	None
Louwahi	Soufiane	Electric Power Engineers	None
Mason	Gary	Monongahela Power Company d/b/a Allegheny Power	Transmission Owner
Mattson	Lisa	Avangrid Renewables, LLC	Generation Owner
McNeil	Justin	Kentucky Public Service Commission	None
McNicholas	Daniel	Nautilus Power, LLC	Generation Owner
Midgley	Sharon	Exelon Business Services Company, LLC	Transmission Owner
Moye	Robert	Tyr Energy, LLC	Other Supplier
Murteira	Ana	Public Service Electric and Gas Company	Transmission Owner
Nadel	Steve	PPL Electric Utilities Corporation d/b/a PPL Utilities	Transmission Owner
Nayar	Ankush	Office of the People's Counsel for the District of Columbia	End-Use Customer
Nicholson	Emma	Federal Energy Regulatory Commission	None
Nix	Emma	Leeward Asset Management, LLC	Generation Owner
Norton	Chris	American Municipal Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor
ODonnell	Colleen	Public Utilities Commission of Ohio	None

Ogg	Joelle	DC Energy, LLC	Other Supplier
Ondayko	Brock	AEP Energy Partners, Inc. (AEP Gen Resources)	Transmission Owner
Parikh	Lopa	Orsted Onshore North America, LLC	Generation Owner
Pakela	Gregory	DTE Energy Trading, Inc.	Other Supplier
Panegal	Ash	Apex Clean Energy Management, LLC	None
Peoples	John	Duquesne Light Company	Transmission Owner
Pezalla	Bill	Old Dominion Electric Cooperative	Electric Distributor
Philips	Marji	Riverside Generating Company, L.L.C.	Generation Owner
Pollard	Albert	Illinois CUB	None
Price	Ruth	Delaware Division of the Public Advocate	End-Use Customer
Prokop	Brenda	Silver Run Electric, LLC	Transmission Owner
Rasmussen	Jay	Duke Energy Business Services LLC	Transmission Owner
Rumsey	Amanda	PPL Electric Utilities Corporation d/b/a PPL Utilities	Transmission Owner
Rutigiano	Thomas	NRDC	None
Sammartino	Michael	Maryland Office of People's Counsel	End-Use Customer
Sasser	Jonathan	Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.	None
Scheidecker	Paul	Monitoring Analytics LLC	None
Searfoorce	Dan	Pennsylvania Public Utility Commission	None
Seigrist	Hal	Fairless Energy, L.L.C	Generation Owner
Selick	Sam	Customized Energy Solutions, Ltd.	None
Shah	Pulin	Exelon Business Services Company, LLC	Transmission Owner
Siegner	Katie	RMI	None
Singh	Harliv	Invenergy, LLC	Generation Owner
Slifer	Diane	GT Power Group	None
Soorya	Radha	Invenergy, LLC	Generation Owner
Sotkiewicz	Paul	E-Cubed Policy Associates	None
Sprinkle	Dan	Louisville Gas and Electric Company/Kentucky Utilities Company	Transmission Owner
Stadelmeyer	Rebecca	Jersey Green Energy LLC	Other Supplier
Stallings	Eric	Tenaska Power Services Co	Generation Owner
Stone	Andy	Non-Member	None
Sturgeon	John	Duke Energy Business Services LLC	Transmission Owner
Svenson	Heather	Public Service Electric and Gas Company	Transmission Owner
Theodore	Sharon	Electric Power Supply Association	None
Thomas	Glen	GT Power Group	None
Thomas	Amber	Exelon Business Services Company, LLC	Transmission Owner
Tubridy	Meg	Rockland Electric Company	Transmission Owner
Ushijima	Hiroaki	Elwood Energy, LLC	Generation Owner
VanBlargan	Bryna	Sabinsville SunPower, LLC	None
Vayda	Brian	Borough of Park Ridge, New Jersey	Electric Distributor
Walker	Jennifer	Exelon Business Services Company, LLC	Transmission Owner
Wassil	Paul	KMC Thermo, LLC	Generation Owner
Whitehead	Jeff	GT Power Group	None
Willson	Miranda	E&E News	None
Wylie-Chambers	Ericka	Exelon Business Services Company, LLC	Transmission Owner
Wynder	Michael	Altrock LLC	Other Supplier
York	Denver	East Kentucky Power Cooperative, Inc	Transmission Owner
Youth	Michael	North Carolina Electric Membership Corporation	Electric Distributor
Zemanek	Kevin	Buckeye Power, Inc.	Electric Distributor

PJM Attendees

Last Name	First Name	Company	Sector
Ahmed	Hamad	PJM Interconnection	None
Afelumo	Foluso	PJM Interconnection	None
Almonte	Arelis	PJM Interconnection	None
Anders	David	PJM Interconnection	None
Asthana	Manu	PJM Interconnection	None
Baizman	Aaron	PJM Interconnection	None
Baker	Scott	PJM Interconnection	None
Bernstein	Matthew	PJM Interconnection	None
Blackwell	Terry	PJM Board	None
Boyle	Glen	PJM Interconnection	None
Bresler	Stu	PJM Interconnection	None
Bruno	Pat	PJM Interconnection	None
Bryson	Mike	PJM Interconnection	None
Buehler	Susan	PJM Interconnection	None
Burkett	Monica	PJM Interconnection	None
Burns	Greg	PJM Interconnection	None
Cabezas	Angela	PJM Interconnection	None
Cairns	Holly	PJM Interconnection	None
Callis	Joe	PJM Interconnection	None
Carroll	Rebecca	PJM Interconnection	None
Chen	Yang	PJM Interconnection	None
Chmielewski	Brian	PJM Interconnection	None
Conboy	Paula	PJM Board	None
Connolly	Matthew	PJM Interconnection	None
Coscia	Carl	PJM Interconnection	None
Coyle	Michael	PJM Interconnection	None
Croop	Danielle	PJM Interconnection	None
Cunningham	Dan	PJM Interconnection	None
Daly	Michael	PJM Interconnection	None
Del Viscio	Mike	PJM Interconnection	None
DeVita	Thomas	PJM Interconnection	None
Dettrey	Mark	PJM Interconnection	None
DiMartino	Denise	PJM Interconnection	None
Downs	Jere	PJM Interconnection	None
Drauschak	Lisa	PJM Interconnection	None
Egan	Amanda	PJM Interconnection	None
Fabiano	Janell	PJM Interconnection	None
Falin	Tom	PJM Interconnection	None
Fan	Zhenyu	PJM Interconnection	None
Feng	Julan	PJM Interconnection	None
Fereshetian	Damon	PJM Interconnection	None
Foley	Sheila	PJM Interconnection	None
Frogg	Darrell	PJM Interconnection	None
Gates	Jill	PJM Interconnection	None
Glazer	Craig	PJM Interconnection	None
Gledhill	Andrew	PJM Interconnection	None
Graf	Walter	PJM Interconnection	None
Greening	Michele	PJM Interconnection	None
Haque	Asim	PJM Interconnection	None
Hartung	Shanna	PJM Interconnection	None

Hauske	David	PJM Interconnection	None
Hendrzak	Chantal	PJM Interconnection	None
Herel	Suzanne	PJM Interconnection	None
Hevey	Andrew	PJM Interconnection	None
Hickey	Mike	PJM Interconnection	None
Hicks	Colleen	PJM Interconnection	None
Horger	Tim	PJM Interconnection	None
Hoshmand	Mojtaba	PJM Interconnection	None
Hu	Yong	PJM Interconnection	None
Johnson	Jeanine	PJM Board	None
Kane	Tim	PJM Interconnection	None
Kazerooni	Hamid	PJM Interconnection	None
Keech	Adam	PJM Interconnection	None
Kelly	Gwen	PJM Interconnection	None
Kenney	Susan	PJM Interconnection	None
Keshavamurthy	Bhavana	PJM Interconnection	None
Kim	Sung	PJM Interconnection	None
Kimmel	David	PJM Interconnection	None
Konowal	Richard	PJM Interconnection	None
Lai	Erin	PJM Interconnection	None
Lockwood	Daniel	PJM Interconnection	None
Loebl	Margaret	PJM Board	None
Lukach	Mike	PJM Interconnection	None
Luska	Kirsten	PJM Interconnection	None
Lynch	Jessica	PJM Interconnection	None
Martin	Amanda	PJM Interconnection	None
Mauroschat	Erich	PJM Interconnection	None
Mayer	Shawn	PJM Interconnection	None
McLaverly	Megan	PJM Interconnection	None
McElwaine	Kathy	PJM Interconnection	None
McElwee	Steve	PJM Interconnection	None
McGill	Susan	PJM Interconnection	None
McGlynn	Paul	PJM Interconnection	None
McGovern	Jason	PJM Interconnection	None
Messina	Emmy	PJM Interconnection	None
Mills	David	PJM Board	None
Miscavage	Dave	PJM Interconnection	None
Mooney	Molly	PJM Interconnection	None
Morelli	Lisa	PJM Interconnection	None
Mulhern	Joseph	PJM Interconnection	None
Murphy Lee	Lori	PJM Interconnection	None
Neifield	Alexa	PJM Interconnection	None
O'Brein	Thomas	PJM Interconnection	None
O'Connell	Moira	PJM Interconnection	None
O'Hara	Chris	PJM Interconnection	None
Olaleye	Michael	PJM Interconnection	None
Oskvig	Dean	PJM Board	None
Papeika	Jim	PJM Interconnection	None
Patel	Anita	PJM Interconnection	None
Patel	Keyur	PJM Interconnection	None
Perera	Asanga	PJM Interconnection	None
Pilong	Christopher	PJM Interconnection	None
Pincus	Steve	PJM Interconnection	None

Rios	Vireli	PJM Interconnection	None
Robinson	Charlie	PJM Board	None
Robinson	Evelyn	PJM Interconnection	None
Rodriguez	Ricardo	PJM Interconnection	None
Salmon	Lisa	PJM Interconnection	None
Scheirer	Alexandra	PJM Interconnection	None
Shields	Jeff	PJM Interconnection	None
Sims	Mark	PJM Interconnection	None
Souder	Dave	PJM Interconnection	None
Souder	Michelle	PJM Interconnection	None
Stefanowicz	Vince	PJM Interconnection	None
Swimm	Nora	PJM Interconnection	None
Takahashi	Mark	PJM Board	None
Terranova	Chris	PJM Interconnection	None
Tribulski	Jen	PJM Interconnection	None
Vanzandt	Vickie	PJM Board	None
Walker	Bill	PJM Interconnection	None
Waweru	James	PJM Interconnection	None
Widom	Stuart	PJM Interconnection	None
Woznyj	Michael	PJM Interconnection	None
Xu	Xu	PJM Interconnection	None
Yeaton	Andrea	PJM Interconnection	None